COURT NO.5

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s). 13029/1985

M.C. MEHTA

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

([TO BE TAKEN UP AT 3.30 P.M.] ----- IN RE: COMMISSION FOR AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT (CAQM) (AIR POLLUTION) AND IMPLEMENTATION OF GRAP IV 1) I.A. NO. 269389/2024 (APPLICATION FOR INTERVENTION) 2) I.A. NOS. 270761 AND 270763/2024 (APPLICATIONS FOR DIRECTION AND INTERVENTION) NAME OF THE FOLLOWING ADVOCATES MAY BE TREATED TO HAVE BEEN SHOWN IN THE LIST: MR. HARISH N. SALVE, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.) MS. APARAJITA SINGH, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.) MR. A.D.N. RAO, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.) MR. SIDDHARTHA CHOWDHURY, ADVOCATE (A.C.) MR. G.S. MAKKER, MR. AMRISH KUMAR, MR. M.K. MARORIA MR. SANJAY KR. VISEN, MR. SUDEEP KUMAR, MR. KARAN SHARMA, MR. SANDEEP KR. JHA MR. JYOTI MENDIRATTA, MR. RAHUL KHURANA, MR. YASH S VIJAY, MR. SAURABH AGRAWAL ADVOCATES)

Date : 28-11-2024 This petition was called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ABHAY S. OKA HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE AUGUSTINE GEORGE MASIH

> Ms. Aparajita Singh,Sr.Adv. (Amicus Curiae) Mr. A.D.N. Rao, Sr. Adv. (Amicus Curiae) Mr. Siddhartha Chowdhury,Adv.(Amicus Curiae) Ms. Shibani Ghosh,Adv. Mr. Ishank Ranjan,Adv.

For the parties:

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, A.S.G.
Mrs. Ruchi Kohli, Sr. Adv.
Mrs. Archna Pathak Dave, A.S.G.
Mr. Wasim Quadri, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Swarupma Chaturvedi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR
Ms. Suhashinin Sen, Adv.
Ms. Chitvan Singhal, Adv.
Ms. Neelakshi Bhadouria, Adv.
Mr. Rohan Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Mukesh Kumar Maroria, AOR
Mr. Rajesh Kr. Singh, Adv.

Mr. Subhranshu Padhi, Adv.

Mr. S S Rebello, Adv. Mr. Jagdish Chandra Solanki, Adv. Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR Mr. Gaurang Bhushan, Adv. Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR Mrs. Alka Agarwal, Adv. Ms. Sonali Jain, Adv. Mr. Ashok Kumar B, Adv. Ms. Baby Devi Bonia, Adv. Mr. Anirudh Bhat, Adv. Mr. Prashant Singh Ii, Adv. Dr. N. Visakamurthy, AOR Mr. Shreekant Neelappa Terdal, AOR Ms. Kanu Agrawal, Adv. Mr. Bhuvan Kapoor, Adv. Mr. Varun Chugh, Adv. Mr. Krishna Kant Dubey, Adv. Ms. Indira Bhakar, Adv. Ms. Manisha Chava, Adv. (Court Commissioner) Mr. Abhinav Aggarwal, Adv. (Court Commissioner) Ms. Srishti Mishra, Adv. (Court Commissioner) Mr. Aditya Bharat Manubarwala, Adv. (Court Commissioner) Dr. Menaka Guruswamy, Sr. Adv. Mr. Yash S. Vijay, AOR Mr. Utkarsh Pratap, Adv. Ms. Arunima Das, Adv. Ms. Aditi Tripathi, Adv. Dr. Menaka Guruswamy, Sr. Adv. Mr. S. Wasim A Quadri, Sr. Adv. Mr. Praveen Swarup, Adv. Mr. Ajay Bansal, Adv. Mr. Devesh Maurya, Adv. Mr. Ravi Kumar, Adv. Ms. Payal Swarup, Adv. Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR Ms. Manali Singhal, Adv. Ms. Diksha Rai, AOR Ms. Aanchal Kapoor, Adv. Mr. Deepak Singh Rawat, Adv. Ms. Shreya Singhal, Adv. Mr. Santosh Sachin, Adv. Mr. Vishal Sinha, Adv. Ms. Shreya Nair, Adv. Ms. Apurva Sachdev, Adv. Mr. Piyush Vyas, Adv. Ms. Purvat Wali, Adv. Mr. Pradyut Kashyap, Adv.

Mr. Lokesh Sinhal, Sr. A.A.G. Mr. B.K. Satija, A.A.G. Mr. Akshay Amritanshu, AOR Mr. Rahul Khurana, Adv. Ms. Himanshi Shakya, Adv. Mr. Nikunj Gupta, Adv. Ms. Drishti Saraf, Adv. Ms. Pragya Upadhyay, Adv. Ms. Swati Mishra, Adv. Ms. Aakanksha, Adv. Ms. Garima Prashad, Sr. A.A.G. Mr. Sudeep Kumar, AOR Ms. Manisha, Adv. Ms. Rupali, Adv. Mr. Gurminder Singh AG/Sr. Adv. Mr. Prashant Manchanda, A.A.G. Mr. Vivek Jain, D.A.G. Mr. Karan Sharma, AOR Mr. Ravindra Kumar, Sr. Adv. Mr. Binay Kumar Das, AOR Ms. Priyanka Das, Adv. Ms. Neha, Adv. Mr. Shivam Saxena, Adv. Mr. Vipin Kumar Saxena, Adv. Mr. Vikas Bharti, Adv. Mr. V P Pandey, Adv. Ms. Sheyl Trehan, Adv. Mr. Chirayu Jain, Adv. Ms. Vidhi Jain, Adv. Mr. Shivendra Singh, Adv. Applicant-in-person Petitioner-in-person Mr. P. K. Jain, AOR Mr. Ramesh Babu M. R., AOR Mr. Rajesh Kumar Chaurasia, AOR Mr. Radha Shyam Jena, AOR Mr. Pradeep Kumar Bakshi, AOR Mr. Ashok Mathur, AOR

Mr. V. K. Verma, AOR Mr. Ajit Pudussery, AOR Mrs. Bina Gupta, AOR Ms. Adviteeya, Adv. Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, AOR Ms. Sujeeta Srivastava, AOR Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR Mr. Anil Kumar Jha, AOR Mr. Mukesh K. Giri, AOR M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR Mr. Sudhir Mendiratta, AOR Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR Mr. Hardeep Singh Anand, AOR Mr. Sandeep Narain, AOR Mr. Sushil Kumar Singh, AOR Mrs. Rani Chhabra, AOR Mr. G. Prakash, AOR Ms. Nandini Gidwaney, AOR Mr. Shri Narain, AOR Mr. Umesh Kumar Khaitan, AOR Ms. Shalini Kaul, AOR Mr. K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR Mrs. K. Sarada Devi, AOR Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR Mrs. Priya Puri, AOR Ms. Manjula Gupta, AOR

Mr. T. V. Ratnam, AOR Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi, AOR M/S. Khaitan & Co., AOR Mr. S. S. Shroff, AOR Mr. Sushil Kumar Jain, AOR Mr. Aniruddha Deshmukh, AOR Mr. Ravindra Bana, AOR Mr. Surya Kant, AOR Mrs. B. Sunita Rao, AOR Mr. Abhishek, AOR Mr. Sarvam Ritam Khare, AOR Mr. Kushagra Sharma, Adv. Mr. Anuj Agarwal, Adv. Mr. R. P. Gupta, AOR Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR Mr. Mohit D. Ram, AOR Mr. Pramod Dayal, AOR Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR M/S. M. V. Kini & Associates, AOR Mr. Rakesh Kumar-i, AOR Mr. Parijat Sinha, AOR M/S. Saharya & Co., AOR Mr. Nishe Rajen Shonker, AOR Mrs. Anu K Joy, Adv. Mr. Alim Anvar, Adv. Mr. Pavan Kumar, AOR

M/S. S. Narain & Co., AOR Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, AOR Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR Mr. Prashant Kumar, AOR Mr. Mahesh Agarwal, Adv. Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR Ms. Binu Tamta, AOR Ms. Pritha Srikumar Iyer, AOR Mr. Vivek Gupta, AOR Mr. Vinay Garg, AOR Ms. G. Indira, AOR Mr. Rahul Kumar, Adv. Mr. Anki Kashyap, Adv. Mr. Sunil Kumar, Adv. Mr. Satya Dev Singh, Adv. Ms. Avni Singh, Adv. Ms. Sangita Malhotra, Adv. Ms. Palvi Talwar, Adv. Mr. Rajbir Singh Takshak, Adv. Mr. Subhro Sanyal, AOR Ms. Misha Rohatgi, AOR Mr. Ravi Prakash, AOR Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv. Ms. Rajkumari Divyasana, Adv. Mr. Indrajit Prasad, Adv. Mr. Vikrant Singh Bais, AOR Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR Mr. K. V. Mohan, AOR

Ms. Surbhi Mehta, AOR

Mr. Shovan Mishra, AOR Ms. G. Indira, AOR Mr. Yoginder Handoo, AOR Ms. Nidhi Jaswal, AOR Mr. Rakesh Kumar-i, AOR Mr. Parminder Singh Bhullar, AOR Mr. Shantanu Jugtawat, Adv. Mr. Chandrakant Sukumar, Adv. Mr. Mukesh Kumar Sharma, Adv. For M/S. Mukesh Kumar Singh And Co., AOR Mr. Arjun D Singh, Adv. Ms. Ankita Sharma, AOR Mr. Kumar Dushyant Singh, AOR Mr. Mukesh Verma, Adv. Mr. Pankaj Kumar Singh, Adv. Mr. Vatsala Tripathi, Adv. Mr. Yash Pal Dhingra, AOR Mr. Ashutosh Dubey, AOR Mr. Chandra Prakash, AOR Mr. Anuj Bhandari, AOR Mr. Anil Kumar, AOR Ms. Lubna Naaz, AOR Ms. Shashi Kiran, AOR Ms. Aastha Mehta, Adv. Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR Ms. Prerana Mohapatra, Adv. Ms. Prina Sharma, Adv. Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, AOR Mr. Anando Mukherjee, AOR Mr. Shwetank Singh, Adv. M/S. Karanjawala & Co., AOR

Ms. Sanjivani Aggarwal, Adv. Ms. Jyoti Aqqarwal, Adv. Mr. Pradeep Shekhavat, Adv. Ms. Filza Moonis, AOR Mr. V. N. Raghupathy, AOR Ms. Charu Ambwani, AOR Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR Ms. Ripul Swati Kumari, Adv. Mr. Rajesh Kumar Maurya, Adv. Mr. Neeraj Shekhar, AOR Mr. Mohit Paul, AOR Ms. Divya Jyoti Singh, AOR Mr. Vinay Garg, AOR Mr. Nischal Kumar Neeraj, AOR Mr. Shalen Bhardwaj, Adv. Mr. Ashok Kumar Panigrahi, Adv. Ms. Lakshmi, Adv. Ms. Ekta Kalra, Adv. Mr. Virender Kumar, Adv. Ms. Garima Kumar, Adv. Mr. Deepender Kumar Pathak, Adv. Mr. Nishit Agrawal, AOR Mr. Yashraj Singh Bundela, AOR Mr. Surjeet Singh, Adv. Mr. Chanakya Baruah, Adv. Ms. Saloni, Adv. Mr. Rohan Singla, Adv. Mr. Syed Miran Ahmad, Adv. Mr. Abhaya Nath Das, Adv. Mr. Om Prakash Sapra, Adv. Mr. Vinod Kumar Shukla, Adv. Mr. Hukum Deo Prasad, Adv. Ms. Monica Goel, Adv. Mr. B C Bhatt, Adv. Mr. Kishor Kumar Mishra, Adv. Mr. S S Bandyopadhyay, Adv. Mr. Rahul Gupta, Adv. Mr. Shashank Sharma, Adv. Mr. Satish Kumar, AOR

Mr. Pulkit Agarwal, AOR Mr. Gaurav, AOR Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR Mr. Saurabh Tripathi, Adv. Mr. Deepayan Dutta, Adv. Mr. T. R. B. Sivakumar, AOR Ms. Manju Jetley, AOR Mr. Harsh V. Surana, AOR Ms. Rakhi Ray, AOR Ms. Ishita Jain, AOR Mr. Anand Kumar Shrivastava, Adv. Mr. Ankit Bhandari, Adv. Mr. Manish Kumar Gupta, AOR Ms. Tulika Mukherjee, AOR Mr. Akshay Girish Ringe, AOR Mr. L.K. Paonam, Adv. Mr. Niraj B. Paonam, Adv. Ms. Tomthinnganbi Koijam, Adv. Ms. Aswathi M.k., AOR M/S. M. V. Kini & Associates, AOR Mr. Pradeep Misra, AOR Mr. Daleep Dhyani, Adv. Mr. Manish Kumar, AOR Mr. Divyansh Mishra, Adv. Mr. Puneet Taneja, AOR Mr. Amit Yadav, Adv. Mr. Manmohan Singh Narula, Adv. Mr. Anil Kumar, Adv. Ms. Vrinda Bhandari, AOR Ms. Charu Mathur, AOR Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, AOR

Ms. Shaqun Matta, AOR Mr. Gopal Jha, AOR Mr. Shishir Deshpande, AOR Mr. D.Kumanan, AOR Ms. Deepa S, Adv. Mr. Sheikh F Kalia, Adv. Mr. Veshal Tyagi, Adv. Mr. Chinmay Anand Panigrahi, Adv. Ms. Pritha Srikumar Iyer, AOR Ms. Rooh-e-hina Dua, AOR Mr. Mudit Gupta, AOR Ms. Divya Roy, AOR M/S. S. Narain & Co., AOR Mr. Shiv Mangal Sharma, A.A.G. Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha, AOR Ms. Nidhi Jaswal, Adv. Ms. Shalini Singh, Adv. Mr. Saurabh Rajpal, Adv. Ms. Puja Sharma, AOR Mr. Gautam Narayan, AOR Ms. Asmita Singh, Adv. Mr. Tushar Nair, Adv. Mr. Anirudh Anand, Adv. Mr. Punishk Handa, Adv. Mr. Neeraj Kumar Gupta, AOR Mr. Danish Zubair Khan, AOR Mr. Vikas Mehta, AOR Mr. H S Phoolka, Sr. Adv. Mr. Niraj Gupta, AOR Mrs. Anshu Gupta, Adv. Mr. Arni Chaudhari, Adv. Ms. Surpreet Kaur, Adv. Mr. Mukesh Kumar Jain, Adv. Mr. Shekhar Kumar, AOR

Mr. Rajan Narain, AOR Mr. Ayush Sharma, AOR Mr. Anurag Kishore, AOR Ms. Mayuri Raghuvanshi, AOR Dr. Brij Bhushan K Jauhari, Adv. Mr. Deepak Jyoti Ghildiyal, Adv. Mr. Harsh Mahan, Adv. Ms. Purnima Jauhari, AOR Mr. Hiren Dasan, AOR Mr. Ajay Vikram Singh, AOR Mrs. Priyanka Singh, Adv. Mr. Shubham Kumar Singh, Adv. Mr. M. Aamir Faiyaz, Adv. Mr. K. Paari Vendhan, AOR Ms. Jaikriti S. Jadeja, AOR Ms. Astha Tyagi, AOR Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR Mr. Kuldip Singh, AOR Ms. Anushree Prashit Kapadia, AOR Mr. Ketan Paul, AOR Dr. Ram Sankar, Adv. Mrs. Harini Ramsankar, Adv. Mrs. Usha Prabakaran, Adv. Mr. Usha Prabakaran, Adv. For M/S. Ram Sankar & Co, AOR Ms. Malvika Kapila, AOR Mr. Gaurav Kejriwal, AOR Mr. Sameer Abhyankar, AOR Mr. Rahul Kumar, Adv. Mr. Aryan Srivastava, Adv. Mr. Aakash Thakur, Adv.

Mr. S. S. Shroff, AOR Ms. Madhumita Bhattacharjee, AOR Ms. Debarati Sadhu, Adv. Mr. Anas Tanwir, AOR Mr. Vikrant Singh Bais, AOR Mr. Soumya Dutta, AOR Mr. Sameer Kumar, AOR Mr. Ajay Pal, AOR Mr. Dhananjaya Mishra, AOR Mr. Rahul Khurana, AOR Mr. Rajiv Yadav, AOR Mr. Vipin Nair, AOR Mr. Rishi Matoliya, AOR Mr. D. Abhinav Rao, AOR Mr. Durga Dutt, AOR Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR Mr. T.K. Nayak, Adv. Ms. Preeti Sehrawat, Adv. Ms. Rashmi Malhotra, AOR Mr. Gaurav Choudhary, AOR Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR Ms. Limayinla Jamir, Adv. Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv. Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv. Mr. Prang Newmai, Adv. Ms. Nidhi Mohan Parashar, AOR Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, AOR Mr. Ravindra S. Garia, AOR

Mr. Talha Abdul Rahman, AOR Mr. Guntur Pramod Kumar, AOR Mr. Keshav Singh, Adv. Mr. M. P. Devanath, AOR Ms. Ruchi Kohli, Sr. Adv. Ms. Srishti Mishra, Adv. Mr. Sumeet Mishra, Adv. Mr. R. C. Kohli, AOR Mr. D. Abhinav Rao, AOR Mr. Prakash Ranjan Nayak, AOR Mr. Nitin Saluja, AOR Mr. Deepayan Mandal, AOR Ms. Shalu Sharma, AOR Mr. Chritarth Palli, Adv. Mr. Sahil Tagotra, AOR Mr. Akhil Anand, AOR Mr. Prashant Singh, AOR Mrs. Prerna Dhall, Adv. Mr. Piyush Yadav, Adv. Ms. Akanksha Singh, Adv. Ms. Pearl Sharma, Adv. Mr. Pranav Sachdeva, AOR Mr. Sameer Shrivastava, AOR Mr. Debojit Borkakati, AOR Mr. Aakarshan Aditya, AOR Mr. Satya Mitra, AOR Mr. Prasanna S., AOR Ms. Mithu Jain, AOR Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR Mr. Mahfooz Ahsan Nazki, AOR

Mr. Shariq Ahmed, Adv. For M/S. Ahmadi Law Offices, AOR Ms. Surabhi Sanchita, AOR Mr. Vinod Sharma, AOR Dr. Ram Sankar, Adv. Mrs. Harini Ramsankar, Adv. Mrs. Usha Prabakaran, Adv. Mr. Usha Prabakaran, Adv. For M/S. Ram Sankar & Co, AOR Mr. Vinodh Kanna B., AOR Mr. Sandeep Singh, AOR Ms. N. Annapoorani, AOR Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR Ms. Neeru Vaid, AOR Mr. Avi Singh, Adv. Mr. Shiven Varma, Adv. Mr. Dhruv Malik, Adv. Ms. Komal Mundhra, Adv. Mr. Saurabh Agrawal, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following O R D E R

1. We had a glance at the second report of the Court Commissioners. What both reports depict is the abject failure of the various authorities to implement Graded Response Action Plan (for short, "the GRAP")-IV measures in its true letter and spirit. There are violations pointed out in both the reports. We request the Court Commissioners to supply the copies of both the reports to the learned counsel representing the States and other stake holders. We expect the States to make a statement before us about the action which they propose to take in

case of breaches which are specifically pointed out by the Court Commissioners.

2. We continue the appointment of the Court Commissioners.

3. We accept the suggestions made by the Court Commissioners and direct the Transport Department of Delhi Government and the Delhi Pollution Control Committee to appoint Nodal Officers for the purposes of facilitating the work by the Court Commissioners.

4. Immediate issue which needs to be addressed is that the trucks are allowed to enter the limits of Delhi and then after travelling some distance, they are taking U-turn to go back to the place from where they have arrived. This issue also needs to be addressed.

5. We make it clear that all GRAP-IV measures except the measures which are modified in respect of the schools will continue to operate till Monday i.e. 2nd December, 2024.

6. We clarify that as far as clause (1) of Stage IV ('Severe +' Air Quality) of GRAP is concerned, there is a complete ban on the entry of all trucks in Delhi except the following categories:

(a) The trucks carrying essential commodities;

(b) The trucks providing essential services; and

(c) All LNG/CNG/Electric/BS-VI diesel trucks.

7. There are no other exceptions admissible under clause (1) of Stage IV. Therefore, if any authority has issued any instructions which run contrary to the above, the same will not bind the Police and other staff posted at the entry points.

In the meanwhile, the Commission for Air Quality 8. Management (for short, "the Commission") will hold a meeting and come out with their suggestions about moving from GRAP-IV to GRAP-III or GRAP-II. We also make it clear that it is not necessary that all measures which are provided in GRAP-IV should be dispensed with. There can be a combination of measures in GRAP-III and GRAP-IV. The suggestions of the Commission with reasons shall be placed before the Court on Monday i.e. 2nd December, 2024. We are informed that our directions in paragraph 4 9. of the order dated 25th November, 2024 has not been implemented by any of the National Capital Region States. We direct the compliance to be made with the said directions at the earliest and in any case on or before

Monday i.e. 2nd December, 2024.

10. Our attention is invited to the compliance report filed by the Commission. Show cause notices have been issued to the various functionaries for taking action under Section 14 of the Commission for Air Quality Management in National Capital Region and Adjoining Areas Act, 2021 (for short, "the Act"). The action needs to be expedited.

11. attention is also invited to 0ur an article appearing in India Today of 27th November, 2024 which records that a Land Records Officer and others admitted that they were advising the farmers to burn stubble after 4.00 p.m. to avoid satellite detection. We are not accepting the correctness of this news item. But if it is correct, it is very serious. The State officials cannot permit any farmer to take advantage of the fact that at present, only those farm fire activities are being detected which take place during few hours of the day. The Government of Punjab shall immediately issue instructions to all the officials not to indulge in any such activities.

12. In terms of paragraph 5 of our last order, the Commission will issue the necessary directions consisting of mitigating measures as suggested by us in paragraph 5. 13. The learned Additional Solicitor General appearing on behalf of the Union of India states that the clarification issued by the Director (Technical) of the Commission on 28th November, 2024 will be withdrawn.

To be listed at the end of the cause list on
 2nd December, 2024.

(ANITA MALHOTRA)(AVGV RAMU)AR-CUM-PSCOURT MASTER