ITEM NO.42 COURT NO.1 SECTION PIL-W

# SUPREME COURT OF INDIA RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

SMW No(s). 2/2024

IN RE: ALLEGED RAPE AND MURDER INCIDENT OF A
TRAINEE DOCTOR IN R.G. KAR MEDICAL COLLEGE AND
HOSPITAL, KOLKATA AND RELATED ISSUES

Petitioner(s)

### **VERSUS**

Respondent(s)

(FOR ADMISSION and IA No.185574/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.190235/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.194010/2024-INTERVENTION **APPLICATION** and IΑ No.185851/2024-INTERVENTION PPLICATION and IA No.194183/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 185161/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IΑ No.192100/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IΑ No. 187643/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.188278/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.192250/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IΑ No.185498/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IΑ No.188323/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.187656/2024-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.187814/2024-INTERVENTION **APPLICATION** No.188500/2024and IΑ INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.187964/2024-INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IΑ No.187639/2024-INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No.185169/2024-INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No.185545/2024and INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IA No.188328/2024-INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No.192908/2024-INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and No.185565/2024-INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IΑ No.192097/2024-MODIFICATION 0F ORDER and No.190236/2024-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and No.187815/2024-IΑ PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON and IA No.194189/2024-PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON and IA No.187646/2024-APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No.192251/2024-APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IΑ No.192912/2024-APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS No.187971/2024-PERMISSION T0 and IA APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION and IA No.187974/2024-PERMISSION TO FILE APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION and IA No.187637/2024-PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES IA No. 199834/2024 APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION IA No. 199837/2024 **APPROPRIATE** ORDERS/DIRECTIONS IΑ No. 200162/2024 **APPROPRIATE** ORDERS/DIRECTIONS IΑ No. 192912/2024 **APPROPRIATE** ORDERS/DIRECTIONS IΑ 200117/2024 No. **APPROPRIATE** ORDERS/DIRECTIONS IΑ No. 187646/2024 **APPROPRIATE** 

ORDERS/DIRECTIONS IA No. 192251/2024 **APPROPRIATE** ORDERS/DIRECTIONS IA No. 205856/2024 **APPROPRIATE** ORDERS/DIRECTIONS IA No. 190236/2024 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION 187643/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 188278/2024 INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 192250/2024 INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 198082/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. INTERVENTION APPLICATION IΑ No. 192100/2024 INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 185851/2024 INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 195966/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION 185574/2024 INTERVENTION APPLICATION IΑ No. 190235/2024 APPLICATION No. 194010/2024 INTERVENTION IA INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 199832/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 187814/2024 INTERVENTION APPLICATION IΑ No. 188500/2024 187656/2024 INTERVENTION APPLICATION IΑ No. INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 205860/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 185498/2024 INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. 188323/2024 **APPLICATION** ΙA 199127/2024 **INTERVENTION** INTERVENTION No. APPLICATION IA No. 200097/2024 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION IA No. INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT 187639/2024 IΑ No. 198027/2024 INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IΑ 199836/2024 No. INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IA No. 202450/2024 INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IΑ 187964/2024 No. INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT 200160/2024 IA No. INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IA No. 185565/2024 INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IA No. 199662/2024 INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IΑ No. 206035/2024 INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IΑ No. 185545/2024 INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT 188328/2024 IΑ No. INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IA No. 192908/2024 INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT IA No. 192097/2024 - MODIFICATION OF COURT ORDER IA No. 187815/2024 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON IA No. 199128/2024 - PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON IA 199839/2024 **PERMISSION** T0 FILE **ADDITIONAL** DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES IA No. 203687/2024 -PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL **DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES** IΑ No. 187637/2024 **PERMISSION** FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES IA T0 197285/2024 **PERMISSION** T0 FILE **ADDITIONAL** DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES IA No. 187974/2024 - PERMISSION TO FILE APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION IA No. 187971/2024 - PERMISSION TO FILE APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION IA No. 200098/2024 - PERMISSION TO FILE APPLICATION FOR DIRECTION)

## WITH

W.P.(Crl.) No. 351/2024 (PIL-W) (FOR ADMISSION)

Date: 30-09-2024 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM : HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE J.B. PARDIWALA HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE MANOJ MISRA

For Petitioner(s)

Mr. Sanjay R.hegde, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Omanakuttan K. K., AOR

Ms. Rambha Singh, Adv.

Mr. Akhilesh Kumar Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Ankit Tiwari, Adv.

Mr. Shahrukh Ali, Adv.

Mr. Tanay Hegde, Adv.

By Courts Motion, AOR

For Respondent(s)

Applicant-in-person, AOR

Mr. Shubhayu Roy, Adv.

Mr. Tavish Bhushan Prasad, AOR

Mr. Rajiv Ranjan Dwivedi, AOR

Ms. Kumud Lata Das, AOR

Mr. Bibhuti Krishna, Adv.

Mr. Aman Anand, Adv.

Ms. Pooja Rathore, Adv.

Mr. Harsh Ajay Singh, Adv.

Ms. Rubina Jawed, Adv.

Mr. Gaurav Prakash Pathak, Adv.

Mr. Ashutosh Anand, Adv.

Mr. Nishant Kumar, AOR

Mr. Shiv Mangal Sharma, A.A.G.

Ms. Shalini Singh, Adv.

Ms. Nidhi Jaswal, AOR

Ms. Tanvi Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Raghav Sabharwal, AOR

Mr. Anukrit Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Mekala Ganesh Kumar Reddy, Adv.

Mr. Aditya Nema, Adv.

Mr. Siddharth Batra, AOR

Ms. Sanjivani Aggarwal, Adv.

Ms. Jyoti Aggarwal, Adv.

Mr. Pradeep Shekhavat, Adv.

Ms. Filza Moonis, AOR

Mr. Tushar Mehta, Solicitor General

Mr. Kanu Agrawal, Adv.

Ms. Swati Ghildiyal, Adv.

Mr. Arkaj Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, AOR

Mr. Anup Kumar, AOR

Mr. Sachin Singh Dalal, Adv.

Mr. Akshat Singh, Adv.

Mrs. Neha Jaiswal, Adv.

Ms. Pragya Choudhary, Adv.

Ms. Shruti Singh, Adv.

Mr. Anupam Lal Das, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Ravinder Singh, Adv.

Mrs. Raveesha Gupta, Adv.

Ms. Garima Jain, AOR

Mr. Ritvik Bhardwaj, Adv.

Mr. Tushar Mehta, Solicitor General

Mr. Mukesh Kumar Maroria, AOR

Mr. Kanu Agarwal, Adv.

Mr. Arkaj Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Swati Ghildiyal, Adv.

Mr. Madhav Sinhal, Adv.

Ms. Meera Kaura, AOR

Mr. Tejas Patel, Adv.

Ms. Tanushree Bhalla, Adv.

Mr. Akshay Girish Ringe, AOR

Mr. Kartikeya Rastogi, Adv.

Ms. Inderdeep Kaur Raina, Adv.

Ms. Bansuri Swaraj, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Siddhesh Shirish Kotwal, AOR

Ms. Ana Upadhyay, Adv.

Mr. Tejasvi Gupta, Adv.

Mr. T.illayarasu, Adv.

Ms. Shymphy Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Arman Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Yeshashvi Shrivastav, Adv.

Ms. Priyanka Dubey, Adv.

Dr. Vinod Kumar Tewari, AOR

Ms. Vrinda Grover, Adv.

Mr. Soutik Banerjee, Adv.

Ms. Devika Tulsiani, Adv.

Mr. Aakarsh Kamra, AOR

Mr. Raghenth Basant, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Ravi Raghunath, AOR

Ms. Kaushitaki Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Aditya Sharan, Adv.

Ms. Shashi Kiran, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Sadhana Sandhu, AOR

Dr. Satish Chandra, Adv.

Ms. Sangita Bhalla, Adv.

Ms. Ashna, Adv.

Mr. Arjun Sain, Adv.

Mr. Mahesh Jethmalani, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Kabir Bose, Adv.

Mr. Amit Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Vikas Singh, Adv.

Mr. Praneet Pranav, Adv.

Ms. Mitakshara Goyal, Adv.

Mr. Abhijeet, Adv.

Ms. Mugdha Pande, Adv.

Ms. Shreya Nair, Adv.

Mr. Siddhartha Sinha, AOR

Mr. Anil Kumar, AOR

Mr. Sameer Abhyankar, AOR

Mr. Rahul Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Aryan Srivastava, Adv.

Mr. Aakash Thakur, Adv.

Ms. Ayushi Bansal, Adv.

Mr. Sarthak Dora, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay R.hegde, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Omanakuttan K. K., AOR

Ms. Karuna Nundy, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Sabyasachi Chatterjee, Adv.

Mr. Subhro Prokas Mukherjee, AOR

Ms. Gargi Goswami, Adv.

Ms. Rishika Rishabh, Adv.

Mr. Amanpreet Singh, Adv.

Ms. Kanishka Gautam, Adv.

Mrs. Srabani Mukherjee, Adv.

Mr. Shekhar Banerjee, Adv.

Mr. Gajendra Singh Negi, Adv.

Mr. Vikas Jain, AOR

Mr. J Sai Deepak, Adv.

Mr. V Shyamohan, Adv.

Mr. Luv Virmani, Adv.

Ms. Anshika Bajpai, Adv.

M/S. Kmnp Law Aor, AOR

Mr. Thomas Oommen, AOR

Mr. Satayam Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sanjeev Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Rajeev Ranjan, Adv.

Ms. Vipasha Jain, Adv.

Mr. Amit Kumar Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Shambhunath Singh, Adv.

Mr. Shashibhushan P. Adgaonkar, AOR

Mr. Shrikrishna Ganbavale, Adv.

Mr. Omkar Jayant Deshpande, Adv.

Mrs. Pradnya S Adgaonkar, Adv.

Ms. Indira Jaising, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Ibad Mushtaq, AOR

Mr. Paras Nath Singh, Adv.

Mr. Rohin Bhatt, Adv.

Ms. Gurneet Kaur, Adv.

Mr. Phiroze Edulji, Adv.

Mr. Anjan Datta, Adv.

Ms. Ishita Srivastva, Adv.

Mr. Vishal Arun Mishra, AOR

Mr. Vivek Kumar Singh, Adv.

Ms. Rupali Panwar, Adv.

Mr. Vivek Sood, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Vijay Arora, Adv.

Mr. Sandeep Gupta, AOR

Mr. Vijay Kumar Dhakane, Adv.

Mr. Karan Singh, Adv.

Ms. Kanchan Gupta, Adv.

Ms. Aishwarya Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Aravindh S., AOR

Mr. Akshay Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Abbas B, Adv.

Ms. Jhuma Sen, Adv.

Mr. Anirudh Sanganeria, AOR

Ms. Swastika Chatterjee, Adv.

Mr. Vishal Tiwari, Adv.

Mr. Abhigya Kushwah, AOR

Mrs. Sunita, Adv.

Mr. Shailendra Mani Tripathi, Adv.

Ms. Kumari Nidhi Tripathi, Adv.

Ms. Eliza Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Pradeep Kumar Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Siddharth Rajkumar Murarka, Adv.

Mr. Rohan Rohatgi, Adv.

Mrs. Shubhangini Rohatgi, Adv.

Mr. Ravindra Kumar Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Mahesh Jethmalani, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Shoumendu Mukherji, AOR

Mr. Ajay Awasthi, Adv.

Mr. Vaibhav Thaledi, Adv.

Ms. Megha Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Mugdha Pande, Adv.

Ms. Arya Jha, Adv.

Mr. Soumava Karmakar, Adv.

Mr. Amit Kumar Rana, Adv.

Mr. Kapil Sibal, Sr. Adv. (Not Present)

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.

Dr. Menaka Guruswamy, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Sanjay Basu, Adv.

Mr. Md. Abu Bakkar Dhali, Adv.

Mr. Sandip Kr. Bhattacharya, Adv.

Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR

Mr. Nipun Saxena, Adv.

Ms. Anju Thomas, Adv.

Ms. Aparajita Jamwal, Adv.

Mr. Sanjeev Kaushik, Adv.

Ms. Mantika Haryani, Adv.

Mr. Shreyas Awasthi, Adv.

Mr. Utkarsh Pratap, Adv.

Ms. Pratibha Yadav, Adv.

Mr. Simranjeet Singh Rekhi, Adv.

Ms. Ripul Swati Kumari, Adv.

Mr. Bhanu Mishra, Adv.

Mr. Lavkesh Bhambhani, Adv.

Ms. Arunima Das, Adv.

Mr. Devadipta Das, Adv.

Ms. Mehreen Garg, Adv.

Ms. Aadya Pandey, Adv.

Ms. Mohini Priya, AOR

Mr. Jamshed Mistry, Adv.

Mr. Sunil Khattri, Adv.

Mr. Maninder Singh, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Prabhas Bajaj, AOR

Mr. Priyanshu Tyagi, Adv.

Mr. Rithvik Mathur, Adv.

Mr. Rishav Rai, Adv.

Mr. Harsh Chauhan, Adv.

Mr. Rangasaran Mohan, Adv.

Ms. Ashita Chawla, Adv.

Mr. Amarpal Singh Dua, Adv.

Mr. R.k. Nayyar, Adv.

Mr. Abhimanyu Tewari, AOR

Ms. Eliza Bar, Adv.

Mr. Vijay Hansaria, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Sneha Kalita, AOR

Ms. Diksha Rai, AOR

Ms. Nimisha Menon, Adv.

Mr. Arijit Dey, Adv.

Ms. Apurva Sachdev, Adv.

Mr. Piyush Vyas, Adv.

Mr. Firdous Samim, Adv.

Ms. Gopa Biswas, Adv.

Mr. Ali Asghar Rahim, Adv.

Mr. Shekhar Kumar, AOR

Mr. Sriram P., AOR

Mr. Ms Vishnu Shankar, Adv.

Mr. Sreenath S, Adv.

Mr. Aditya Santosh, Adv.

Ms. Sheejish Pt, Adv.

Ms. Anjali Singh, Adv.

Ms. Isha Singh, Adv.

# UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following O R D E R

1 The parents of the deceased have been disconcerted by repeated clips in the

social media containing her photographs and name. Besides these clips, videos have also proliferated in the social media.

- The earlier order of this Court shall, it is clarified, not be confined only to Wikipedia but shall apply to all intermediaries. To reiterate, no intermediary shall allow or carry the publication of the name of the deceased, her identity, photographs or videos, either pertaining to the incident at the RG Kar Medical College or otherwise.
- On the request of the Court, the Solicitor General has stated that the Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology (MEITY) shall nominate a nodal officer to whom any communication in relation to the unauthorised uploading of content or information pertaining to the deceased can be intimated so that necessary action can be taken with the intermediary concerned for pulling down such publication or dissemination.
- A fourth status report dated 13 September 2024 by the DIG/Head of Branch Special Crime-I, Central Bureau of Investigation (CBI) has been submitted to the Court. The status report indicates several leads in the investigation which are being followed up by the CBI and the steps which have been taken in the course of investigation.
- At this stage, when the investigation is in progress, it would not be appropriate to set down the details of the investigation or the leads which are being followed by the CBI since that would compromise the status and effectiveness of the investigation.
- 6 The CBI, as it appears before the Court, is conducting an investigation on two

### facets:

- (i) The alleged rape and murder which took place on 9 August 2024 at RG Kar Medical College and Hospital; and
- (ii) The allegations in regard to financial irregularities which were also entrusted for investigation by the CBI by the orders of a Division Bench of the Calcutta High Court.
- Whether each of the above are disconnected features or whether there is a relationship between the two, will be investigated by the CBI.
- During the course of the hearing, learned counsel appearing on behalf of the resident doctors as well as their associations have drawn attention to the fact that several persons against whom there are serious allegations of misdemeanour in the Medical College and Hospital are still occupying positions of authority. The status report which has been submitted by the CBI indicates that several of these aspects are still under investigation.
- The submission of the doctors to the effect that persons in positions of responsibility in Medical College and Hospital should either be suspended or be directed to proceed on leave should be examined by the State Government as the appointing and disciplinary authority.
- Mr Rakesh Dwivedi, senior counsel appearing for the State of West Bengal, has submitted that if the CBI shares with the State Government such preliminary material which would indicate the complicity of any person in position of authority in threatening or harassing the junior or senior resident doctors or

nurses, the State Government will duly take necessary action in accordance with law consistent with the Service Rules and Regulations.

- The investigating team of the CBI shall also scrutinise whether the irregularities which are noticed in the context of the RG Kar Medical College and Hospital cover not just that Hospital and Medical College in question, but extends to other such institutions within or outside the State. Thereafter the Court may take a call on what further directions to the CBI would be required to ensure that the investigation covers other aspects which may travel beyond the incidents which have taken place at the RG Kar Medical College and Hospital.
- The fresh application, being IA No 213387 of 2024, which has been filed in that regard is taken on the file. Details of the IA may be shared with the Investigating Officer of the CBI.
- The Principal Secretary, Health, Government of West Bengal who is present in the course of the hearing, has informed the Court that following the incident which took place on 9 August 2024, the State Government has brought in two officers as the Principal of the Medical College and Hospital and as the Medical Superintendent and Vice-Principal. These officers are:
  - (i) Prof Dr Manas Banerjee, who was earlier posted as Principal at the Barasat Medical College; and
  - (ii) Prof Dr Sapatarashi Chatterjee, who was previously posted as the Medical Superintendent and Vice-Principal, Bankura Medical College.
- 14 The status report which has been submitted by the State of West Bengal

indicates the following position in regard to the ongoing work for installing security equipments and upgrading the facilities at 28 medical colleges :

"Category of Work	Additional Demands placed	Sanctioned work started	Percentage of work completed	Remaining works to be completed within (Date)
Duty Room	893	893	49%	31.10.2024
Wash Room	724	724	40%	31.10.2024
Lighting arrangement	4348	4348	33%	25.10.2024
CCTV	6178	6178	26%	31.10.2024"

As regards the status of the work at the RG Kar Medical College and Hospital, the status report is in the following terms :

"Category of Work	Additional Demands placed	Project sanctioned	Present status of work execution	To be completed by
Duty Room	71	71	Tender matured; the Principal sought approval from the Investigatin g Agency to commence work	31.10.2024
Wash Room	45	45	-Do-	22.10.2024
Lighting arrangemen t	250	250	Work completed (40%)	25.10.2024
CCTV installation	575	575	255 installed (45%)	20.10.2024"

13

16 Though the State has indicated that the remaining work will be completed within

a time frame of 31 October, the Court has been assured that the State would

make all endeavour to completed the work by 15 October 2024.

17 The State shall positively ensure that the work is completed by 15 October 2024

18 Ms Indira Jaising, senior counsel appearing on behalf of the Resident Doctors

made a solemn statement that pursuant to the hearing which took place in court

on the last occasion, all doctors have rejoined their duties. Responding to the

statement of Mr Rakesh Dwivedi, senior counsel appearing on behalf of the State

of West Bengal that the doctors are not performing IPD and OPD duties, Ms

Jaising categorically stated that all the doctors are performing all essential and

emergency work including IPD and OPD work.

19 List the Petitions on 15 October 2024 at 2.00 pm.

20 The Solicitor General shall place on the record the outcome of the proceedings

before the National Task Force and indicate the progress which has taken place.

(GULSHAN KUMAR ARORA)
AR-CUM-PS

(SAROJ KUMARI GAUR) ASSISTANT REGISTRAR